# CR-39 Results Obtained Using Pd/D Co-deposition 

Pamela A. Mosier-Boss
Lawrence P.G. Forsley

## SRI Replication of CR-39 Results



## Schematic of SRI Replication Cell


$\nabla 60 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ PE between CR-39 \& Ag/Pd/D cathode
$\nabla$ LET curves indicate that $60 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ PE will block 7 MeV alphas and 1.8 MeV protons
$\nabla$ The detector underwent microscopic examination, it was scanned, and sequentially etched

## Microscopic Analysis SRI Detector


$60 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ PE film between cathode and detector

## Two Triple Tracks were Observed on the SRI detectors: Evidence of > 9.6 MeV Neutrons

Johan Frenje, MIT, "I must say that the data and their analysis seem to suggest that energetic neutrons have been produced," (ACS, 2009)


## Spatial Distribution of Tracks



Scanned Results


FRONT


BACK

V Ohmic measurements indicated that the Pd metal had not gone through the PE film
V Tracks correlated with the Pd deposit

- Pd deposit is the source of the tracks


## Example of a Scanned Image

image

focus inside pits

objects identified

green = tracks


## Automated Scanner Results Obtained for the CR-39 Detector used in the SRI Replication



## Sequential Etching Analysis (Lipson and Roussetski)



LET Spectrum Analysis (Zhou, NASA)


## Cause of the Trough at ~ 11 MeV ?


$\nabla$ The 3.4-14 MeV protons are 12.6-17.5 MeV p that have been slowed down by the Pd, water film, and PE film
$\nabla$ Expect a continuum of energies. But there is a trough at $\sim 11 \mathrm{MeV}$.

- This trough suggests that protons with these energies are being consumed


## F. Ditrói et al., J. Radioanal. Nucl. Chem., vol 272, 231 (2007)



| Nuclide | $\overline{\mathrm{Pd}, \mathrm{p}}$ <br> Reaction | Half-Life | Decay Mode | Daughter Isotope |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ${ }^{105} \mathrm{Ag}$ | $\begin{aligned} & { }^{105} \mathrm{Pd}(\mathrm{p}, \mathrm{n})^{105} \mathrm{Ag} \\ & { }^{106} \mathrm{Pd}(\mathrm{p}, 2 \mathrm{n})^{105} \mathrm{Ag} \\ & { }^{108} \mathrm{Pd}(\mathrm{p}, 4 \mathrm{n})^{105} \mathrm{Ag} \\ & { }^{110} \mathrm{Pd}(\mathrm{p}, 6 \mathrm{n})^{105} \mathrm{Ag} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | 41.29 d | $\boldsymbol{\beta}^{+}$ | ${ }^{105} \mathrm{Pd}$ | Will see Ag that decays back to Pd |
| ${ }^{105 m} \mathrm{Ag}$ | Same as for ${ }^{105} \mathrm{Ag}$ | 7.23 min | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { IT (99.66\%) } \\ \beta^{+}(0.34 \%) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & { }^{105} \mathrm{Ag} \\ & { }^{105} \mathrm{Pd} \end{aligned}$ |  |
| ${ }^{106 m} \mathrm{Ag}$ | $\begin{aligned} & { }^{106} \mathrm{Pd}(\mathbf{p}, n)^{106 \mathrm{~m}} \mathrm{Ag} \\ & { }^{108} \mathrm{Pd}(\mathbf{p}, 3 \mathrm{n})^{106 \mathrm{~m}} \mathrm{Ag} \\ & { }^{110} \mathrm{Pd}(\mathbf{p}, 5 \mathrm{n})^{106 \mathrm{~m}} \mathrm{Ag} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | 8.28 d | $\begin{gathered} \beta^{+} \\ \text {IT }\left(4.16 \times 10^{-6} \%\right) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & { }^{106} \mathrm{Pd} \\ & { }^{106} \mathrm{Ag} \end{aligned}$ | Will see Ag |
| ${ }^{110 \mathrm{~m}} \mathrm{Ag}$ | ${ }^{110} \mathrm{Pd}(\mathrm{p}, \mathrm{n})^{110 \mathrm{~m}} \mathrm{Ag}$ | 249.8 d | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \beta^{-(98.64 \%)} \\ & \text { IT (1.36\%) } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & { }^{110} \mathrm{Cd} \\ & { }^{110} \mathrm{Ag} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | that decays to Cd |

## J. Dash et al., J. New Energy, vol. 1, 23 (1996);

 ICCF10; ICCF11bulk Pd before \& after electrolysis


Pd/D co-dep after electrolysis

$\boldsymbol{\nabla}$ Silver was observed in high, localized concentrations shortly after electrolysis
$\nabla$ Examination 15 months later showed the presence of cadmium in addition to silver
$\nabla$ Changes in ratio between $A g L_{\beta 1}$ and $A g L_{\alpha 1}$ peak indicated that $A g$ is slowly changing to Cd

- The $A g L_{\beta 1}$ peak overlaps with the $C d L_{\alpha}$ peaks


## Review of Analysis of SRI Detectors

V Microscopic analysis and Automated Analysis (major/minor axis analysis)

- Neutrons: 2.5 MeV and > 12 MeV
- Charged particles: > 10 MeV protons, energetic alphas
$\nabla$ Sequential Etching
- Neutrons: 2.5 MeV
- Charged particles: $\mathbf{3} \mathbf{~ M e V ~ p}{ }^{+}$, 12 MeV and 16 MeV alphas
V Linear Energy Transfer Function Analysis
- Protons: 2.5-15 MeV
- Alphas: Continuum of alpha energies, possible neutron recoils

Three methods of analysis yielded complementary results

The observed protons and neutrons can be accounted for by the following primary (1 and 2 ) and secondary ( 3 and 4) fusion reactions:

$$
\begin{align*}
& D+D \rightarrow T(1.01 \mathrm{MeV})+p(3.02 \mathrm{MeV})  \tag{1}\\
& \mathrm{D}+\mathrm{D} \rightarrow \mathrm{n}(2.45 \mathrm{MeV})+{ }^{3} \mathrm{He}(0.82 \mathrm{MeV})  \tag{2}\\
& \mathrm{D}+\mathrm{T}(\leq 1.01 \mathrm{MeV}) \rightarrow \alpha(6.7-1.4 \mathrm{MeV})+\mathrm{n}(11.9-17.2 \mathrm{MeV})  \tag{3}\\
& \mathrm{D}+{ }^{3} \mathrm{He}(\leq 0.82 \mathrm{MeV}) \rightarrow \alpha(6.6-1.7 \mathrm{MeV})+\mathrm{p}(12.6-17.5 \mathrm{MeV}) \tag{4}
\end{align*}
$$



## Effect of $60 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ PE Film



PE film


PE film blocks < $7 \mathrm{MeV} \alpha, 0.82 \mathrm{MeV}{ }^{3} \mathrm{He}$, and 1.01 MeV T

$\nabla$ Zhou indicated that the effect $60 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ PE film will have on the energies of the charged particles was taken into account
$\nabla$ LET curves indicate that :

- > 11 MeV protons will traverse through the 1 mm thick CR-39 detector and PE film
- $60 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ PE will block 7 MeV alphas


## From Zhou's Analysis (of Both Detectors) :

$\nabla$ The alpha and 0-9 MeV protons tracks (643) on the backside are actually due to neutrons ( $D+D \rightarrow{ }^{3} \mathrm{He}+\mathrm{n}$ )
F Frontside alpha tracks (18200) are due to long range alphas (LRA)

- The 1-7 MeV alphas are due to 7-15 MeV alphas that have been slowed down by the Pd, water film, and PE film
$\nabla$ Frontside $p$ tracks (9873) between 2.6-3.4 MeV due to $p$ ( $D+D$ $\rightarrow p+t)$
V Frontside p tracks (51734) between 3.4-15 MeV due to p (D + $\left.{ }^{3} \mathrm{He} \rightarrow \alpha+\mathrm{p}(12.6-17.5 \mathrm{MeV})\right)$
- The 3.4-12 MeV protons are 12.6-17.5 MeV p that have been slowed down by the Pd, water film, and PE film


## Primary Reaction Branching Ratio: Estimated Number of DD Neutrons (10-5 \&10-6)

| $\mathrm{D}+\mathrm{D} \rightarrow$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{T}(1.01 \mathrm{MeV})+ \\ & \text { blocked } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{p}(3.02 \mathrm{MeV}) \\ & 9873 \text { tracks } \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\mathrm{D}+\mathrm{D} \rightarrow$ | ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}(0.82 \mathrm{MeV})+$ blocked | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{n}(2.45 \mathrm{MeV}) \\ 643 \text { tracks (back) } \\ \text { Corrected } \# \text { tracks }=1286 \text { (front \& back) } \\ \varepsilon^{*}=1.17 \times 10^{-4} \\ n=1.1 \times 10^{7} \end{gathered}$ |

*Neutron efficiency from M.T. Collopy et al., Rev. Sci. Instrum., vol. 63, p. 4892 (1992)
${ }^{\ddagger}$ Confirmation: analysis of CR-39 used in Mylar experiment 248 DD n tracks
$\varepsilon=1.17 \times 10^{-4}$
30\% of tracks are elliptical
$n=3.03 \times 10^{6}$ (for one detector)
$\mathrm{n}=6.06 \times 10^{6}$ (for two detectors)


## Primary Reaction Branching Ratio: <br> Estimated Number of DD Protons (10-5 \& 10-6)

| $\mathrm{D}+\mathrm{D} \rightarrow$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{T}(1.01 \mathrm{MeV})+ \\ & \text { blocked } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{p}(3.02 \mathrm{MeV}) \\ 9873 \text { tracks; Corrected \# tracks }=19746 \\ p>1.32 \times 10^{6} \end{gathered}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\mathrm{D}+\mathrm{D} \rightarrow$ | ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}(0.82 \mathrm{MeV})+$ blocked | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{n}(2.45 \mathrm{MeV})^{\ddagger} \\ 643 \text { tracks (back); Corrected \# tracks = } 1286 \text { (front \& back) } \\ \varepsilon=1.17 \times 10^{-4} \\ \mathrm{n}=1.1 \times 10^{7} \end{gathered}$ |



- Approximately half of the tracks were counted by the scanner
-Need to take into account the absorption of charged particles during their escape from the bulk of a thick sample, whose thickness is several times greater than the stopping range of 3 MeV protons in Pd - use TRIM (Transport of lons in Matter)
- Most of the protons traveling through $15 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ of Pd will reach the detector.
- The $\mathrm{Ag} / \mathrm{Pd}$ layer is $\sim 1 \mathrm{~mm}$ thick
- Number of protons is off by a factor of ~66.67

Estimated $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{p}$ branching ratio is 8.3 . This is the maximum value of the $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{p}$ branching ratio as the number p of protons is underestimated

## Lipson et al., Fusion Technology, Vol. 38, p. 238 (2000)

NE213 LSD

$\nabla$ Used 40-60 $\mu \mathrm{m}$ thick $\mathrm{Au} / \mathrm{Pd} / \mathrm{PdO}$ heterostructures that were electrochemically loaded
$\nabla I_{n}=(19 \pm 2) \cdot 10^{-3} \mathrm{n} / \mathrm{s}$ and $\mathrm{I}_{\mathrm{p}}=(4.0 \pm 1.0) \cdot 10^{-3} \mathrm{p} / \mathrm{s}$ in a $4 \pi$ solid angle

- The lower level of proton emissions is attributed to the absorption of charged particles during their escape from the bulk of a thick sample, whose thickness is several times greater than the stopping range of $\mathbf{3 ~ M e V}$ protons in Pd
V n/p ratio estimated to be 4.75


## Secondary Reaction Branching Ratio:

Estimated Number of DT Neutrons (10-5 \&10-6)

| $\mathrm{D}+\mathrm{T} \rightarrow$ | $\alpha(6.7-1.4 \mathrm{MeV})+$ <br> blocked | $\mathrm{n}(11.9-17.2 \mathrm{MeV})$ <br> 2 2 triple tracks |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\mathrm{E}+{ }^{3} \mathrm{He} \rightarrow$ | $\alpha(6.6-1.7 \mathrm{MeV})+$ <br> blocked | $\mathrm{p}\left(12 \times 10^{-5}, \mathrm{n}=1.18 \times 10^{6}\right.$ <br> 51734 tracks $)$ |

Neutron efficiency from M.T. Collopy et al., Rev. Sci. Instrum., vol. 63, p. 4892 (1992)

$\varepsilon_{D T}=5.0 \times 10^{-5}$ is for all three types of interactions
3.38 \% of the DT generated tracks were triple tracks

## Secondary Reaction Branching Ratio:

Estimated Number of D3 ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}$ Protons (10-5 \&10-6)

| $\mathrm{D}+\mathrm{T} \rightarrow$ | $\alpha(6.7-1.4 \mathrm{MeV})+$ <br> blocked | $\mathrm{n}(11.9-17.2 \mathrm{MeV})$ <br> 2 triple tracks |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\mathrm{D}+{ }^{3} \mathrm{He} \rightarrow$ | $\alpha(6.6-1.7 \mathrm{MeV})+$ <br> blocked | $\mathrm{p}(12.6-17.5 \mathrm{MeV})$ |
|  | 51734 tracks, Corrected \# tracks $=103468$ <br> $p=2.83 \times 10^{5}$ to $3.28 \times 10^{5}$ |  |



- Approximately half of the tracks were counted by the scanner
- TRIM calculations:
-12.6 MeV protons traveling through 315
$\mu \mathrm{m}$ of Pd will reach the detector. The $\mathrm{Ag} / \mathrm{Pd}$ layer is $\sim \mathbf{1 m m}$ thick. Number of protons is off by a factor of $\sim 3.17$ -Most of the 17.5 MeV protons traveling through $365 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ of Pd will reach the detector. The $\mathrm{Ag} / \mathrm{Pd}$ layer is ~ 1 mm thick. Number of protons is off by a factor of ~2.74


## Summary on Branching Ratios

| Reagents | Reaction Products |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $D+D$ | $\mathrm{T}(1.01 \mathrm{MeV})$ <br> \# of tritons $>1.32 \times 10^{6}$ | $\mathrm{p}(3.02 \mathrm{MeV})$ <br> \# of protons $>1.32 \times 10^{6}$ |
| $\mathrm{D}+\mathrm{D}$ | $3 \mathrm{He}(0.82 \mathrm{MeV})$ <br> \# of ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}=1.1 \times 10^{7}$ | $\mathrm{n}(2.45 \mathrm{MeV})$ |
|  | $\alpha(6.7-1.4 \mathrm{MeV})$ <br> \# of alphas $=1.18 \times 10^{6}$ | $\mathrm{n}(11.9-17.5 \mathrm{MeV})$ |
| $\mathrm{D}+\mathrm{T}$ | $\alpha(6.6-1.7 \mathrm{MeV})$ <br> \# of neutrons $=1.18 \times 10^{6}$ |  |
| $\mathrm{D}+{ }^{3} \mathrm{He}$ | $\mathrm{p}(12.6-17.5 \mathrm{MeV})$ |  |
|  | \# alphas $=2.83 \times 10^{5}$ to <br> $3.28 \times 10^{5}$ | \# of protons $=2.83 \times 10^{5}$ to $3.28 \times 10^{5}$ |

- Indicates that the primary reactions are approximately equal
- Indicates that DT reactions are slightly favored over ${ }^{3} \mathrm{HeD}$ reactions


## Efficiency of Secondary Reactions



| Reaction | $\sigma$ at 10 keV <br> (barn) | $\sigma$ at 100 keV <br> (barn) | $\sigma_{\text {max }}$ (barn) |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $D+\mathrm{D} \rightarrow \mathrm{T}+\mathrm{p}$ | $2.81 \times 10^{-4}$ | $3.3 \times 10^{-2}$ | 0.096 |
| $\mathrm{D}+\mathrm{D} \rightarrow{ }^{3} \mathrm{He}+\mathrm{n}$ | $2.78 \times 10^{-4}$ | $3.7 \times 10^{-2}$ | 0.11 |
| $\mathrm{D}+\mathrm{T} \rightarrow \alpha+\mathrm{n}$ | $2.72 \times 10^{-2}$ | 3.43 | 5.0 |
| $\mathrm{D}+{ }^{3} \mathrm{He} \rightarrow \alpha+\mathrm{p}$ | $2.2 \times 10^{-7}$ | 0.1 | 0.9 |

Expect more DT reactions than $\mathrm{D}^{3} \mathrm{He}$ reactions

## Summary on Branching Ratios

| Reagents | Reaction Products |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| D + D | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{T}(1.01 \mathrm{MeV}) \\ \# \text { of tritons > } 1.32 \times 10^{6} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} p(3.02 \mathrm{MeV}) \\ \# \text { of protons }>1.32 \times 10^{6} \end{gathered}$ |
| D + D | $\begin{gathered} { }^{3} \mathrm{He}(0.82 \mathrm{MeV}) \\ \# \text { of }{ }^{3} \mathrm{He}=1.1 \times 10^{7} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{n}(2.45 \mathrm{MeV}) \\ \# \text { of neutrons }=1.1 \times 10^{7} \end{gathered}$ |
| D + T | $\begin{gathered} \alpha(6.7-1.4 \mathrm{MeV}) \\ \# \text { of alphas }=1.18 \times 10^{6} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{n}(11.9-17.5 \mathrm{MeV}) \\ \text { \# of neutrons }=1.18 \times 10^{6} \end{gathered}$ |
| $\mathrm{D}+{ }^{3} \mathrm{He}$ | $\begin{gathered} \alpha(6.6-1.7 \mathrm{MeV}) \\ \text { \# of alphas }=1.80 \times 10^{5} \text { to } \\ 3.18 \times 10^{5} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathrm{p}(12.6-17.5 \mathrm{MeV}) \\ \text { \# of protons }=1.80 \times 10^{5} \text { to } \\ 3.18 \times 10^{5} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |

- Indicates that most of the tritons produced are consumed to create 11.9-17.5 MeV neutrons
- Secondary reactions have a higher cross section and occur at lower energies compared to primary reactions
- A 1.01 MeV triton, once born, can go through $4.12 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ Pd - equivalent to passing through 10,236 unit cells in the lattice
- Bockris has reported seeing a loss of tritium during Pd/D co-deposition


## Bockris: Tritium in Pd/D Co-deposition ICCF3 (1992)


$\nabla$ Dashed lines indicate the calculated expected concentrations of tritium in the solution and gas phases.
$\boldsymbol{\nabla}$ Pd/D co-dep on Au: 6 out of 9 experiments showed tritium production
$\nabla$ Tritium production was observed when low tritiated $D_{2} \mathrm{O}$ was used.

- A burst of tritium was observed in the gas phase. At the same time, or with a slight delay, a bust of tritium occurred in the solution phase.
- A loss of tritium was observed in the solution phase when high
tritiated $\mathrm{D}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ was used. Suggests that the tritium is being consumed
- At ICCF17, Koreans reported similar results using closed cells



## Transmutation



- EDX shows a small Pd peak and the presence of $\mathrm{Fe}, \mathrm{Cr}, \mathrm{Ni}$, and Al
- EDX detection limits are on the order of 0.1\%
-Distribution on new elements is inhomogeneous
- These same elements have been reported by others using a wide variety of conditions
- Are the new elements the result of multi-body deuteron fusion or the disintegration of the Pd lattice?
-The relative size of the Pd peak suggests the latter


## Different Spots on the Same Cathode



## The Smoking Gun




- Fission reactions produce 7-16 MeV alphas (long range alphas)
- As the source of the long range alphas is fission, it is very likely that the new elements observed in the EDX spectrum result from fissioning of Pd


## Conclusions

- CR-39 detectors, used in Pd/D co-deposition experiments, were subjected to microscopic analysis, automated scanning, sequential etching, and LET spectrum analysis to identify the particles responsible for the tracks
- Particles identified were 2.45 MeV neutrons, 3-10 MeV protons, 2-15 MeV alphas, and 14.1 MeV neutrons
- Nature of the nuclear reactions
- Protons, neutrons, and 2-7 MeV alphas observed in CR-39 detectors used in Pd/D co-deposition have energies consistent with those obtained from primary and secondary fusion reactions
- Branching ratio of primary reactions is close to unity
- DT reactions are favored over ${ }^{3} \mathrm{HeD}$ reactions
- Transmutation is probably the result of fissioning of the Pd nucleus. This is supported by the observation of long range alphas ( $7-15 \mathrm{MeV}$ )


## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- Mitchell Swartz, Gayle Verner, and Peter Hagelstein for organizing the colloquium
- Peter for asking hard questions
- Frank Gordon, Larry Forsley, and Dr. Khim for their support
- Stan Szpak for developing the Pd/D co-deposition protocol
- Fran Tanzella and Ben Earle for doing the replication
- My husband, Roger Boss, and kids (Matt, Nathan, \& Jacob) for putting up with years of revolving schedules around my experiments

